

Greater Essex County District School Board PROGRAM AND ACCOMMODATION REVIEW HERMAN FAMILY OF SCHOOLS

Tuesday, May 8, 2012 at 4:30 p.m.

Report of a committee meeting held at Coronation School



Attendance: Josh Canty, Dominique Labbe-Samarane, Valerie Palesh, , Herman; Debra Cooper, Debbie Pestowka (arrived late) Dawn Holmes (arrived late), Coronation; Roz Breshgold, Jillian Gouin, Ann Nasser, Davis; Joe Younan, Karen Mangham, Kim Lunansky, Maxwell; Nancy Drew, Jenna Schertzer, Rick McKellar, Derek Demonte, McCallum; Lynn McLaughlin, Suzanne Cape, Minelle Toussaint-Greene, Pat Roberts (left at 7 p.m.), McGregor; Milka Brown, Teodora Takeva, Dave Bak-Neilson, Roseville, Paul Antaya, Area S.O.(arrived late)

Chair: Kelly Schwab

Regrets: Heather Wilson

Absence: Aimee Poirier

Facilitator: Terry Lyons

Recorder: Lynne Hornby

THAT THE SUPERINTENDENT RESPONSIBLE FOR ACCOMMODATIONS CONDUCTS A PARC STUDY OF THE HERMAN FAMILY OF SCHOOLS TO:

- i. ALLEVIATE OVER CAPACITY ENROLMENT AT McCALLUM
- ii. REDUCE THE NUMBER OF EMPTY STUDENT SPACES AND IMPROVE THE UTILIZATION RATES WITHIN THE FAMILY OF SCHOOLS.

1. Call to Order and Welcome

The meeting was called to order at 4:38 p.m. by Chairperson Schwab thanking everyone for their attendance and Principal Cooper for hosting the meeting.

2. Review of minutes

The minutes of the April 16 meeting have been circulated to the committee. There being no changes, they are now posted to the Board website under the PARC icon.

3. Examination of advantages and challenges of brainstorming ideas

The committee has discussed the many options, eliminating several to the point that seven remain, with an additional idea presented via e-mail from a committee member, following the April 16 meeting.

This evening, before making final decisions, the committee needs to determine a common philosophy and a frame of reference for decision making. It is not favourable to present opposing recommendations.

A committee member suggested that the proposal e-mailed after the last meeting should be discounted and that any future votes by the committee should be by secret ballot.

The common philosophy of the committee was developed:

1. High school should remain open
 - community, lack of space at neighbouring schools
 - French Immersion and technology
 - Urban programming
2. Necessity to close or consolidate school(s)
3. Two different challenges – over enrolment in French Immersion and under enrolment in English schools
4. Splitting school populations from consolidated schools needs to be minimized

The Board is unable to explore and make hypothetical determinations as to renovating playgrounds etc. until final recommendations are brought forth. The committee must determine the feasibility of the recommendations moving forward.

Superintendent Lyons and Ms. Hinchliffe have already met with the principal of Herman in an effort to determine the viability of some of these options with the principal.

The following seven recommendations were explored further by the committee:

1. Close Coronation and McGregor and transition students to McCallum and all French Immersion McCallum students transition to Herman making Herman a JK-12 school.
By consensus, the committee determined to eliminate this option as portables would be required, additional parking spaces would be required, thereby eliminating green space. Students would be travelling past Maxwell to access McCallum.
Option 1 is eliminated.
2. McCallum western boundary to be adjusted at Walker Road.
Current McCallum students living west of Walker Road will attend Giles FI
All grade 7 and 8 English students go to Herman
Close Maxwell and students transition to McGregor (K-6)
Close Coronation and students transition to Roseville and Davis (K-6)
By consensus, the committee determined to omit this option as it is exactly the same as option 4.
Option 2 is eliminated.
3. All McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)
Close McGregor and students transition to the new McCallum
Adjust Maxwell boundary and students east of Polonia Park would transition to Coronation
By consensus, the committee determined to omit this option as it exactly the same as No. 5
Option 3 is eliminated.
4. Close Maxwell and Coronation
Adjust McCallum's western boundary to Walker Road. All current McCallum students living west of Walker Road would attend Giles FI
All gr 7 and 8 English students to Herman
Maxwell closes. JK-6 Maxwell students transition to McGregor
Coronation closes. JK-6 Coronation students transition to Roseville and Davis
Chair Schwab called the vote on whether to leave the McCallum western boundary adjustment on the table as an option.
The vote was called and it was DEFEATED.
Option 4 is eliminated
5. Close McGregor
McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)
McGregor closes. McGregor students transition to the new McCallum
Maxwell's eastern boundary adjusted to Polonia Park. Current Maxwell students living east of Polonia Park transition to Coronation.
Option 5 remains.
6. Close McGregor and Maxwell
McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)
McGregor closes. Students living North of Tecumseh Road transition to new McCallum. Students living south of Tecumseh Road would transition to Davis.
Maxwell closes. Students living east of Pilette transition to Coronation. All other students transition to the new McCallum
Option 6 remains.

7. Close McGregor and Coronation

All McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)

McGregor closes. All McGregor students transition to the new McCallum

Coronation closes. Coronation students transition to Roseville/Davis/new McCallum

By consensus the committee chose to eliminate because wherever possible the committee does not want to split school populations. In this scenario, 217 students are being split and are being sent to different schools. This option does not fill McCallum.

Option 7 is eliminated.

Additional submission via email after meeting:

8. Maxwell Students east of Pillette move to Coronation

Herman absorbs the remainder of the JK-8 English Students from McGregor and Maxwell

McCallum remains French Immersion with new Western Walker Road Boundary

McGregor and Maxwell close

Discussion took place to determine support of recommendation 8 being brought forward for consideration

Chairperson Schwab called a vote by secret ballot and it

CARRIED

Advantages

Closes two schools with high FCI

Improves Herman utilization rates

Utilizes empty space at other schools

Meets both mandates

Challenges

Uncertainty of permanent F.I. site west of Walker Road

Splitting Maxwell and McCallum students

Not being able to keep Herman family intact

Associated costs

Possible transportation costs

Chair called vote on whether to leave the McCallum western boundary adjustment on the table as an option

The vote was called and it was

DEFEATED

Option 8 is eliminated

4. Discussion

FCI and renewal figures are standardized by the Ministry of Education in order that a small school can be compared to a large school.

Unutilized FDK monies must be used for FDK only.

When a business case is submitted, the Ministry of Education is looking for utilization rates to be maximized. They also prefer business cases that require the least amount of investment for the best solution, this usually involves consolidation and closure of schools. Those are the usual cases that get approved.

The committee took a short break at 6:15 for 20 minutes.

When the committee reconvened, the Chair advised that during break, she had been asked if we could remove the possible McCallum western boundary adjustment at Walker Road.

Further discussion took place.

It was noted that if this boundary adjustment is removed, then some options will have to be discounted. A western boundary adjustment provides sustainability at McCallum by transitioning approx. 122 students, however, these students would be lost from the Herman family as the secondary feeder school for Giles FI is currently Sandwich SS. It was felt by several committee members that the Herman family's concerns should be resolved within the Herman family.

There are currently 2 solutions on the floor for McCallum, which are; western boundary adjustment or move all the students together to Herman.

At this juncture, it is important that the committee determines if there is a common belief that the adjustment of the McCallum boundary at Walker Road is a fair option. A comment was made that it might be a good idea for those who live adjacent to the school but not necessarily for those involved west of Walker Road as a whole.

Some felt that the McCallum western boundary adjustment causes little disruption for the least amount of students.

It was felt by some that by removing options 4 and 8 we are no longer providing an alternative for McCallum. By removing them, the only option on the floor for those students would be a relocation of their program to the secondary school.

Some committee members went on to express disappointment at the elimination of options 4 and 8.

It was clarified that any addition to McCallum is an FDK addition only, not for growth and delays a viable solution for approximately 2 years only.

Further discussion ensued regarding the removal of option 8. The Superintendent added that while it may be better to provide options to the community, the committee must really believe in the options they are bringing forward. He cautioned against giving parents options just to appease.

The McCallum principal noted that the school recently went through an eastern boundary adjustment and there was little opposition.

The committee agreed that they were comfortable with options 5 and 6. At 7:30 p.m. A committee member asked that the Chair request the committee re-examine options 4 and 8 for reconsideration.

A vote was called and it was

CARRIED.

The McCallum boundary adjustment was put back on the floor for reconsideration, i.e. options 4 and 8.

Option 8 was examined. Option 6 removes all French Immersion students out of their school to move English students in and could create conflict between English and French families. Options 6 and 8 are almost identical as both transition elementary groups of students to the secondary setting; in (6) we are moving French Immersion students and in (8) we are moving English students to the high school. A committee member noted that we need to not think of them as English and French but rather just as students. We are faced with solving issues over buildings, not French Immersion or English; it is about utilization of our buildings in the most effective manner so we don't lose students. The committee reached consensus on moving forward with option 8.

Option 8 remains.

By consensus, the committee determined they would be moving forward with 4 recommendations. They are:

4. Close Maxwell and Coronation
Adjust McCallum's western boundary to Walker Road. All current McCallum students living west of Walker Road would attend Giles FI
All gr 7 and 8 English students to Herman
Maxwell closes. JK-6 Maxwell students transition to McGregor
Coronation closes. JK-6 Coronation students transition to Roseville
5. Close McGregor
McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)
McGregor closes. McGregor students transition to the new McCallum
Maxwell's eastern boundary adjusted to Pilette Road. Current Maxwell students living east of Pilette Road transition to Coronation.
6. Close McGregor and Maxwell
McCallum students transition to Herman (JK-12)

McGregor closes. Students living North of Tecumseh Road transition to new McCallum. Students living south of Tecumseh Road would transition to Davis.

Maxwell closes. Students living east of Pillette transition to Coronation. All other students transition to the new McCallum

8. Maxwell Students east of Pillette move to Coronation
Herman absorbs the remainder of the JK-8 English Students from McGregor and Maxwell
McCallum remains French Immersion with new Western Walker Road Boundary
McGregor and Maxwell close

Superintendent Lyons noted that a letter will be prepared from his office that must be sent home by each school on Wednesday, May 9. Principals were asked to watch for an e-mail around 1 p.m.

5. Update on status of draft report

Copies were distributed

There is a need to make the community understand why we have been involved in a PARC in this family of schools.

Need to determine who will assist the Chair in writing the report and presenting at the community meeting. Chair Schwab requested that volunteers remain at the close of the meeting to finalize details.

6. Questions

Questions were answered throughout the meeting and are noted.

7. Additional Committee meeting dates

Next committee meeting will be determined following the community meeting on May 14, if necessary.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 8 p.m.

Distribution:

Minutes of April 16 meeting

Charting of ideas